

# Voices Matter! A Reflective Analysis of Graduate Students' Assessment on Instructional Systems Design Program

ESTELA C. ITAAS  
ORCID NO. 0000-0002-1200-3653  
[estela012060@gmail.com](mailto:estela012060@gmail.com)

Bukidnon State University  
Malaybalay City, Philippines

## ABSTRACT

The study described the reflective analysis of the eight ISD graduates for school years 2016, 2017 and 2018. The graduates were interviewed of their reflections on the assessment on the courses taken in the Instructional Systems Design (ISD) curriculum considering their relevance, effectiveness, adequacy of content/topics; availability of references; and impact. The data gathered are considered primary sources because they are based from actual experiences of the participants. The findings revealed that after their graduation from the Ph.D. in Education with specialization in ISD program there was horizontal and vertical rise in rank and promotion. They revealed that the curriculum and subjects are relevant, effective and had a great impact. They also find the contents and topics adequate, however, they find the available references inadequate and limited. The ADDIE (Assessment, Design, Developed, Implement and Evaluate) Model was most helpful when they go through with the research and dissertation.

**Keywords:** Reflective analysis, Instructional Systems Design, Assessment

## INTRODUCTION

Assessment of graduates on their advance studies is in demand worldwide for the purposes of improving the curriculum, accreditation and other quality assurance evaluation. Tracking the graduates' in their respective program is helpful in assessing the performance of the university. The graduates' accomplishment could ensure the university's educational product as consistent to the vision, mission, goals and philosophy that it adheres to, as well as, to the graduates' aspirations for self-fulfillment and the job market that absorb them. This is the relevance of

today's current situations when it demands for techno-socio-economic development.

In this 21<sup>st</sup> century, the universities worldwide embrace the use of tracer studies for various reasons. One of reasons is to accredit their study programmes. Secondly, to explain the link between study programmes and the job market; thirdly, to show uniqueness and positioning of individual universities; and lastly, to enable universities and institutions managing higher education in their respective countries make informed an evidence based decisions about improvements and quality education and services in higher education (Schomburg, 2011). This is given priority and importance when more accrediting bodies examine if not evaluate the program standards of the universities worldwide.

Tracing the alumni re-invigorate that rapport between the universities and the graduates. The experience, insight and knowledge embodied in the largest segment of the AIT academic community is a rich source of feedback. It helps keep AIT abreast on the emerging trends and to retain a lead role in the kind of specialized advancement that is required for human resource development. In summarizing the tracer study on the host of findings through structuring a synopsis to draw inference, major issues are addressed. These are as follows: context and design, sample and feedback, background off AIT students, status 2000, impact assessment, satisfaction of the AIT program of studies in retrospection and appraisal of its usefulness, higher studies after graduation from AIT students, status 2000, impact assessment, satisfaction of the AIT study programs and suggestions, contacts among AIT graduates, affection with Germany, reflections on the findings (World Bank Group, 2001).

The Ph.D. Instructional Systems Design (ISD) program of Bukidnon State University Graduate School had produced a number of graduates. There was a paradigm shift due to some concerns that were raised by administrators, one of which was the graduates are not aligned with the education specialization. Although, the name itself is for instruction, the program was modified into Ph.D. in Education with specialization in ISD which was approved by the Board of Regents. Hence, there is now a good harvest of students in this program. Graduates after the revision of the program, i.e., graduates of School year 2016 to 2018 were the focus of the study.

The study would become the basis for information investigating into the accomplishments of the ISD graduates after their studies at Bukidnon State University. Since the ISD graduates are trained to become trainers and designers, and because they are in this level when they had achieved greater academic skills particularly on reflective and critical thinking, the questions in the questionnaire

are more open minded. The participants are free to write their opinion and reflective insights into how they have grown and developed into self-fulfilled individuals.

This study revealed the reflective analysis of the ISD graduates on their training at Bukidnon State University, citing how they fare in their present positions/jobs. Specifically, the study answered the following questions: What is the assessment of the ISD graduates on the subjects/courses taken in the ISD curriculum considering their: relevance; effectiveness; adequacy of contents/topics; availability of references; and impact?

## FRAMEWORK

This study considers that assessment of one's program through reflective analysis is worthwhile. The development of reflective capacity and the habit of reflective thinking of the student or professional achieves certain broader, more lasting outcomes as well. Dewey (1933) asserts that reflection is the foundation for democracy through developing the capacity for open-mindedness, wholeheartedness, and responsibility. Kolb's (1984) theory shows how important it is to assess our basic beliefs that may blind us to new knowledge. Finally, Schön's model (1987) leads the professional to becoming an expert.

Dewey (1933) further asserts that a key point is that informed action follows this reflective thinking process and leads to more ideas and therefore generates more experience on which to reflect. "Reflective thinking impels to inquiry". In fact, to Dewey, reflective thinking fosters the development of three attitudes that further the "habit of thinking in a reflective way." These three attitudes are: open-mindedness (freedom from prejudice); wholeheartedness or absorbed interest and responsibility in facing consequences.

This study is also hinged on the concept that assessment of program taken by the student constitute one form of empirical study which can be considered an appropriate means of evaluating the results of the education and training provided by the school at a given situation (Schomburg & Kimani, 2002). From the tracer study the school could assess the curriculum of a particular program as to whether this is contributory to the kind of job the graduates will be able to obtain. The feedback of the graduates on the relevance, and effectiveness, on the courses taken could become a data-base information system as to how the school would revise or enrich the curriculum. Curriculum reengineering and restructuring can be based from the comments and feedback of its graduates and their reflections in terms of their practically, responsiveness, and efficiency in their jobs.

The Gibbs (1988) model of reflection suggests that the process of reflection is systematic and follows a number of specific steps in order to be successful. This model of reflection is a type of formal reflection, which draws on research and puts forward a theory as to how most effectively put into practice to process of reflection. When the school tracks down its graduates, a feeling of importance and pride are demonstrated by them because, it is evidence that they are recognized and remembered. Often students take for granted that their education matters when they are already immersed in their work. This is because they seldom do a kind of reflective analysis on what made them the kind of person they are now. However, when given a tracer questionnaire, they reminisced their academic roots, the gamut of which lies in the kind of training that they have undergone from their alma mater. This make the tracer study relevant not only for the school but for the graduates who respond to the questionnaire.

Instruments done on tracer studies contain several information-gathering data that usually reflect a very long list. The contents could include the background profile of the respondents, the personal data, the educational and professional background, the socio-economic background, employment related information, the competencies and skills developed, the curriculum, and other relevant information about the graduates. Terms of Reference (TOR) in a tracer study generates information on the relevance of the curriculum in contributing to the national/regional for a, networking, usefulness of the degree as resource and credential, etc. (Mohanty, B., n.d)

In this particular study the instrument would require the participants to do some reflective analysis on what they have experienced and learned during their ISD training. It will assess the curriculum or their course in terms of its relevance, effectiveness, availability of resources and references, adequacy of contents/topics, and impact. From their reflections of their learning experiences, they can give suggestions on how to improve the ISD program of Bukidnon State University.

Reflective analysis entails an active, persistent and careful consideration of any belief or supposed form of knowledge in the light of grounds that support it and the further conclusions to which it tends (Smith, 2016). In this study, reflective analysis is done with the ISD training at Bukidnon State University and how this training had contributed to the kind of person/employee/worker they are now.

*Relevance of the Study* refers to how important the subjects offered in the ISD program considering the title of the course which is on Instructional Systems Design. *Effectiveness* of ISD Curriculum refers to the meaningful intent of the course such that the students will yield the desired result as stated in the goals of the program. *Adequacy* of content and topics refers to sufficiency of the content to

allow the graduates to be component in their field of specialization. *Availability of references* refers to how rich the curriculum is in terms of references, materials and resources found in the library teachers references, internet references, etc. *Impact of the training* refers to how the training/program affect or influence the students in terms of their application of what has been learned, impressions after the degree program was acquired, values acquire and other aspects of the training that are considered important by the students.

The usual reason for the tracer studies is to find the whereabouts of graduates particularly as to what jobs they are employed. The data from the Commission on Higher Education (CHED) website showed that the number of college students enrolling and graduating every year in various disciplines showed 1.3% graduates from Mass communication and documentation courses, yet many of this graduates are working at jobs not related to their degrees. Even among UP graduates in the journalism department there are no data as to the whereabouts of its graduates, but journalism professors and veteran business writers estimate the number to around 12% (Macale, 2003).

The tracer study on the study graduates of polytechnic and vocational schools in Malaysia focused on the employability characteristics of its graduates and the quality of the graduates and skilled workers that they are intended to be their respective PTV training programmes. The survey was conducted through a questionnaire and the study revealed that the employment prospects for PTVV graduates were generally good and a large majority found jobs in their field of specialization. In terms the quality of training programmes and PTV graduates, the study indicate increase and qualitative improvements in the institutions, course offered and curriculum changes affected (SEAMEO Innotech, 2003).

The 14 respondents indicated that they will recommend TTU to other prospective students interested in fisheries because the school provided excellent preparation for their future employment. Extensive field based experiences took place outside the classroom affording the students many opportunities to a wide variety of exposure to field work. The graduates were pleased with their coursework and identified some subjects they find to be very useful (Kranz et al., 2004).

Insights gained from the literature revealed that it is not for assessment of graduates on their programs or tracer study at that to have a good number of graduates as respondents. This would depend upon the graduates of a particular program. In the case of the Ph.D. in Education major in ISD of Bukidnon State University where there are only 8 graduates, this number would be sufficient especially that the tracer is qualitative.

## OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

The study explored the reflective analysis of the ISD graduates on their training at Bukidnon State University citing how they fare in their present positions/jobs. Specifically, the study answered the objective; to assess the ISD graduates on the subjects/courses taken in the ISD curriculum considering their relevance, effectiveness, adequacy of content/topics; availability of reference, and impact.

## METHODS

The study employed the qualitative descriptive using narrative analysis type of research. The study was conducted in the College of Education particularly the Graduate Program of Bukidnon State University. It is a good training ground for research apprentice, especially the graduate students who are to come up with their thesis or dissertation outputs before graduation. The academic institution is located in Malaybalay City and accessible to the clientele.

The participants did a kind of reflective analysis on what they would answer to the question given. To “reflect” is to “think quietly and calmly, viewing back the experiences gained, and to express these thoughts and opinions resulting from one’s reflection”. To “analyze” means “the separation of a whole.” Hence, the purpose of “reflective analysis” is to examine what parts of the subject are there, and how these parts fit or not fit together, and to improve the overall fitting of parts together. This is what the ISD graduates did in their responses to the tracer question given to them.

The university has an overall total enrollment of 10,580 as of SY 2018-2019. Of these number, 740 are enrolled in the masters’ degree while 180 enrolled in Ph.D. degree programs, which include; Ph.D in Education major in Instructional System Design, Master in Educational Administration, Master in Public Administration, Master in Guidance and Counseling, and Master in Education with specializations in Mathematics Education, English Language Teaching, and Science Education.

All the eight graduates of the Ph.D-ISD during the commencement exercise in 2016, 2017, and 2018 were taken purposively in the study. There were 2 graduates in 2016, another 4 graduates in 2017, and 2 graduates in 2018. The profile of the eight ISD graduates who were the participants of the study indicated the year they graduated, the number of years they took to finish the ISD degree, their position before they graduate and their position after they graduated. They also indicated the school they are teaching before and after their degree was completed. The 7 ISD graduates are all females and 1 male. All 8 participants have education courses

as their forte considering that the ISD programme required them to have a good background in education and institution.

The dissertation of the participants are mostly on the development of instructional materials for training; development of training design/schemes/ prototypes; and training packages which teachers can use in their instruction/teaching. As to the participant’s position and/or designation before and after their degree, it is obvious that there is a vertical rise in promotion for the graduates.

For the instrument of the study, considering that the participants are already at the peak of their academic career, the instrument used is a constructed questionnaire which would require them to do some kind of reflection and critical thinking in the process of answering the questions. The questions in the questionnaire are answerable by explanation, discussion, narrative account, opinions and other higher cognitive skills. These are shown in the succeeding presentation and discussion of the results.

Table 1

*Profile of the ISD Participants*

Code	No. of years to finish	Year graduated	Position/Rank before obtaining the ISD degree	Position/Rank after obtaining the ISD degree
ISD 1 2016	6	2016	Faculty in the Secondary School Laboratory Dean Educ. Dept.	Extension Director in 2016 Faculty of the College of Education since 1986 to 2015 Faculty Associate to the President 2015 to 2016
ISD 2 2016	4	2016	Teacher of the DepEd ALS Coordinator in the DepED	ALS Supervisor
ISD 3 2017	3 ½	2017	Faculty	Faculty
ISD 4 2017	4	2017	Faculty of Pilgrim College, Cagayan de Oro City	Dean, College of Education Pilgrim College, College De Oro City
ISD 5 2017	4	2017	Teacher of DepEd	DepEd Supervisor
ISD 6 2017	6	2017	Faculty of the Secondary School Laboratory Science Teacher	Coordinator of the Graduate School in Math and Science Programs

Table 1 Continued

Code	No. of years to finish	Year graduated	Position/Rank before obtaining the ISD degree	Position/Rank after obtaining the ISD degree
ISD 7 2018	4 ½	2018	Faculty of the College of Education	Student Teaching supervisor
ISD 8 2018	4	2018	DepEd Teacher	Master Teacher School Head

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### *Assessment of the students' opinion on the ISD Education*

Question 1. What is your opinion of the Education you received while in the Ph.D in Education with specialization in ISD program at Bukidnon State University?

#### Matrix 1. Responses of graduates to question 1

Code	Response to Question 1:
ISD 1 - 2016	It helps enhance my research capability. It introduces me to new ways of addressing educational problems.
ISD 2 - 2016	The Bukidnon State University ISD Program is one of the best. The education I received has really made me a better person. I'm proud I took this program before I really retired.
ISD 3 - 2017	The education I received while in the Ph.D. in Education major in ISD program could help me design instruction, training and methodologies to achieve quality education.
ISD 4 - 2017	It was the best education I've ever had. I daresay best for the reason that the ISD program prepared me further to broaden my outlook as a teacher. Needless to say, the said program equipped me with the necessary skills to become efficient and effective instructor and administrator.
ISD 5 - 2017	I think I received the best education in my profession as a teacher at the same time as an instructional designer. It provided me an optimum knowledge on deciding what methods of instruction are best for the enhancement of my students' and teachers' knowledge and skills.
ISD 6 - 2017	Although it promoted independent learning, the curriculum did not include the latest trends in educational designs. The curriculum must be updated and enhanced considering the recent trends in the 21 <sup>st</sup> Century education.
ISD 7 - 2018	The ISD program which was my Ph.D course is very relevant to the trend in education today and even in the future because of its unlimited scope that it covers almost all aspects of the different fields of discipline.
ISD 8 - 2018	The ISD subjects are useful in my present position especially major subjects and cognates because those are theories of instructions we have in the field that are implemented. The design instructions fit in our implemented instructions. It can develop students to be competent and artistic designers in our own field.



The assessment of the graduates on the ISD program had enriched them as a person and a professional. They consider this program as the best that ever happened to them. They were enhanced professionally. The program prepared them for their work, making them a designer of instruction. Participant 6 however responded the inadequacy of the program in terms of its modernization and updates. She stated that, *the curriculum did not include the latest trends in instructional design. The participant's suggestion is in order and this was given importance by the university especially that it is the dream of the university to give quality and excellence to graduates for them to be globally competitive.*

The rest of the participants were appreciative that the problem was very helpful and the best thing that happened to them. This was reflected by Participant 4 when she said: *It was the best education I ever had. I dare say best for the reason that the ISD program prepared me further to broaden my outlook as a teacher. Needless to say, the said program equipped me with all the necessary skills to become efficient and effective instructor.* Respondent 3 also gave a similar view, when she said *the ISD Program of Bukidnon State University is one of the best. The education I received has really made me a better person. I'm proud I took this program before I really retired.* These responses indicated that the graduates were grateful and thankful for the education they received at Bukidnon State University.

This finding is enhanced by Jack & Job (1997) of Michigan Tech University who considered their graduates as obtaining technical communication skills and the level of proficiency. Similarly, the tracer study of the graduates from the University of Nairobi indicate that the knowledge and skills gained from their courses as being used in their work as rated quit highly (Kimani, 2001).

### **Assessment on the Relevance of the ISD Program**

For the interview question on their assessment on the ISD curriculum in the terms of *relevance*, Matrix 2 illustrates the response of the graduates.

Question 2. How do you assess the subject/course you have taken in the ISD Curriculum in terms of their relevance?

Matrix 2. Responses of graduates to question 2.

Code	Response to question 2.
ISD 1 – 2016	It is very much relevant for me
ISD 2 – 2016	The concepts can be translated to actual performance/work, very relevant!
ISD 3 – 2017	The relevance of the program is in tune to the needs of the times. A decade ago this program was unheard of, but now that it is being revived, teachers, supervisors and educators should avail of it. The relevance of the program has in its call for administrators to design his/her own program to suit his/her specialization
ISD 4 – 2017	Super-relevant, indeed the subjects offered had one thin to offer, learn and acquire the program to the maximum of your skills.
ISD 5 – 2017	Very relevant in terms of education innovations as our technological society increases its role of change
ISD 6 – 2017	Average
ISD 7 – 2018	It's entirely new and very relevant to serve for future education
ISD 8 – 2018	The theories are applicable to DepEd actual design instructions

Except for participant 6 who considers the relevance as “average” the assessment of the rest of the graduates of ISD admitted that the program was very relevant for them especially those who are already administering. The become designers of instruction, teaching strategies, instructional materials and assessment tools, and these are very relevant in their work. Administrators and teachers need to know how to develop and construct materials for effective teaching and learning.

Since most of the graduates are already occupying administrative positions like being a director, a dean, a chairperson, a principal and even a professor, their learning from the ISD curriculum had empowered them to innovate and construct. The principle of constructivism was really applied in their work and outputs. Production of materials becomes easy for them. Even transfer of learning was evident when they conduct trainings and seminars to their teachers and colleagues.

This finding is supported by Kranz, et al. (2004) when he mentioned that the graduates of Tennessee Technical University were pleased with their coursework and identified some subjects they find to be very useful. Similarly, the ISD students were pleased with their program because this had trained them to become trainers. The findings of Kimani’s tracer study (2001) indicate that the knowledge

and skills gained from their courses were relevant to their work assignment. Generally the courses offered by institutions are relevant to the world of work.

**Assessment on the Effectiveness of the ISD Program**

Question 3 presents the results and discussion on the assessment on the ISD curriculum in the terms of *effectiveness*, Matrix 3 illustrates the response of the graduates. The graduates find the ISD curriculum as very effective. They were able to use the theories and the practical applications of the courses especially in their dissertation writing and in developing and designing materials. For the graduates, their course had developed in them creativity and innovativeness. This is very important for teachers and administrators because one does not have to stagnate. New knowledge, materials and learning have to be implemented to keep abreast with the times.

Question 3. How do you assess the subject/course you have taken in the ISD Curriculum in terms of their effectiveness?

Matrix 3. Responses of graduates to question 3.

Code	Response to question 3.
ISD 1 – 2016	For me it is very effective
ISD 2 – 2016	The theories/concepts learned in class give positive/effective results when used in class. Teaching gives practical results
ISD 3 – 2017	Those taking the course may find themselves very effective as administrators, supervisors, principals or teachers
ISD 4 – 2017	Really super effective. I'm using the teaching styles I learned now and they are truly amazing as my students enjoy in my class
ISD 5 – 2017	Very effective. I find the curriculum a knowledge base to effect change
ISD 6 – 2017	Average
ISD 7 – 2018	It gives confidence that whatever things are learned today will always be relevant to the learning that will take place in the future
ISD 8 – 2018	The subjects are adapted in making dissertation... both the book and the modules are designed in a package and these are effective to the teaching and learning

The courses even allowed them to provide for better teaching and learning styles. They could try out innovative ideas and have these validated. They are trained to

document their findings as in research form thus, paving the way for making their materials research-based. It would seem that the graduates are really thankful for having taken these subjects and courses helped her to come up with her dissertation materials which are now commercialized, and she is enjoying the benefits of her gains.

From the tracer study of Schumburg & Sawyerr (n.d) examined if the education given to the graduates had been producing the kind of skills they expect from their graduates. This would indicate the effectiveness of the programs which are seen as important tools for institutional development in a rapidly changing world.

### ***Assessment on the Adequacy of Content/Topics in the ISD Program***

The graduate's responses as to the adequacy of the content and topics in the ISD curriculum are reflected in Matrix 4. For them the topics and the content are relevant and useful. Only one commented that the content and topics were "average" in adequacy. The graduates' also commented that the topics are very adequate and these are not confined only to what are found in the syllabus. Teachers encouraged the students to do a lot of readings and research and to surf the internet for more references. So the students are encouraged to do more research about the topics and contents through online sources in the credible websites.

Students are not also limited to work only on specific topics. They could broaden their perspective and not merely confine themselves to what they already knew. The new technology is explored and the possibility of designing and developing materials in this area are also being undertaken. The study conducted by Mugabushaka et al. (2003) assessed the effectiveness of the Bachelor of Education Programme in meeting job needs of the graduates. One of the findings indicated that the graduates were very positive with regard to the extent of their use of knowledge and skills acquired during their studies at the faculty of the education, indicating that the programme has been able to meet the challenge of the jobs of the results after graduation.

Question 4. How do you assess the subject/course you have taken in the ISD Curriculum in terms of the adequacy of content and topics?

Matrix 4. Responses of graduates to question 4.

Code	Response to question 4
ISD 1-2016	It is very adequate and helpful for me
ISD 2-2016	Very adequate. The ISD students are given adequate topics to developed their skills as a designer
ISD 3-2017	These are topics that are needed in today’s educational system like improving reading skills, science, math and technology
ISD 4-2017	Very relevant also, content were within bounds of the course
ISD 5-2017	Topics were excellent in content! Almost all major activities and experiences relate to other discipline of instruction
ISD 6-2017	Average
ISD 7-2018	The content and topics are good instruments in acquiring the needed learning for the ISD course
ISD 8-2018	The content and topics are very important and fit into the development of training design and package

The teachers see to it that since the students are adult learners, the principle of andragogy is applied wherein the learners are responsible for their learning, and wherein they construct ideas based from their repertoire of knowledge and skills. Since the course is mostly on designing and validating materials, the students find this a good and satisfying experience because at the end of every course they are expected to have some output. This could be in the form of research, instructional modules, instructional materials or anything. The idea is really to follow the ADDIE model of instructional systems design, wherein they need to assess, design, develop, implement and evaluate.

While the graduates commented that the topics and contents were adequate and effective, some subjects were revised to really respond to improving the curriculum. When the AACCU Team evaluated the ISD curriculum, they found that some courses are repeating thus they suggested for the opening of the subjects like *Educational Technology and Alternative Media Assessment* in lieu of repeating subjects like *Instructional development* and *Instructional Development II*; *Instructional Module I* and *Instructional Module II* the last 2 subjects were merged into one, now described as *Developing Instructional Materials* because Instructional Modules would be too specific.

***Assessment on the availability of reference in the ISD Program***

The graduates' responses to the availability of references indicated that the references for the course are very limited and inadequate. However, the professors in the different courses have personal materials which are very rich and varied. The library materials may not be very rich, especially that the course is new and not common and the topics are generic. However, the inadequacies are supplemented by materials found in internet. With the advancement of technology the problems on the dearth of reading materials become less. Students learn to become more resourceful and creative. They use their initiative as to where they can locate resources. They learn to share and produce materials.

Question 5. How do you assess the subjects/courses you have taken in the ISD Curriculum in terms of availability of references?

Matrix 5. Responses of graduates to question 5.

Code	Responses to question 5
ISD 1-2016	The references are limited
ISD 2-2016	Limited references
ISD 3-2017	When I took the course, there were several references available to me which I made use of especially those found in the internet. We can google the materials we need
ISD 4-2017	More than enough, surfing the net helps
ISD 5-2017	It has inadequate references. We relied on the internet access information only
ISD 6-2017	The print materials were Very limited. But we can nevertheless use the internet
ISD 7-2018	References were very limited using the print materials but well provide by the teachers for the students
ISD 8-2018	The available references are applicable to all ISD subjects

The problem with materials used in the ISD courses is that these are varied. One course have several materials for the different topics. One topic could have one book; hence it is not necessarily one book for the whole course. Generally in many of their subjects in the undergraduate's levels, the course description also has a book parallel to the title of the course, hence it is very easy to locate the references. But for the ISD courses, there are several books of different titles that could fit into

topics covered in the course; hence one cannot really find a single reference for a particular subject.

It is really true that the library lacks the references for the ISD course because this course is very rare. Only Bukidnon State University is offering this course in the country. So most of the sources can be bought in other countries still but very expensive. That is the primary reason of having inadequate references and other materials in ISD program. Nevertheless, ISD students have more access to the internet; hence while they think that the library has inadequate books on their subjects, they could still avail of resources from the web. This makes their resources very rich.

### ***Assessment on the Impact of the ISD program***

As to the impact of the ISD Program, the graduates find that this had a very great impact for them. Considering that the course is new and not common and the only one in the country, the students realized that they are uniquely different. When they will graduate, they will become designers, developers, trainers, and managers. The impact that the course had given them boosted their morale and added to their confidence. It prepared them to face the challenges of their jobs. Now they are a person because they can create and innovate.

According to Mavanja, M.K. (n.d) elaborate professionalism and vocationalization should be reserved for the post graduates training. The ISD program encourages professionalism and scholarly work to differentiate this from the undergraduate and graduate courses. The ISD graduates have realized that they are different from the other doctoral graduates because they are now producers of materials. These materials are research based and this makes their work different from the other materials that they have. Even the commercialized textbook may stand inferior to their work because these commercialized textbooks may not have undergone try-out and validation. But their work is processes using the ADDIE Model. First they conduct a needs assessment, then they design, develop, implement and evaluate before they produce.

For the ISD graduates what they did were the signs of a scholarly work. It is research-based and they were proud of their output. One graduate commented that the program prepared them to face challenges as it made them creative and innovative. This is one of the skills that is very useful for the educational systems especially in the 21<sup>st</sup> century education.

When asked to how they find their learning experiences with their peers, their response showed that they learned from one another. In this course, the approach is collegial and collaborative. Teamwork is the password. Everyone is treated like a colleague. Hence it is obvious that each one respect one another and learn from

each other. In an atmosphere of collegiality and collaboration, collegial and collaborative stimulation are very evident. Students work cooperatively in their group assignments, projects and outputs. They also engaged in individual work but sharing of ideas is encouraged. For this kind of teaching-learning approach, students become more mature and are being challenged.

Question 6: How do you assess the subjects/courses you have taken in the ISD Curriculum in terms of its impact?

Matrix 6. Response of graduates to question 6

Code	Response to question 6
ISD 1 – 2016	it encourage me to learn more about ISD and its usefulness to instruction
ISD 2 – 2016	great impact in the fields of education
ISD 3 – 2017	This was a new course, so the impact on my position as a teacher was very significant. I had several ways on how to handle them reading program. I made modules. I design a program that can be used in a reading and language setting
ISD 4 – 2017	Gave me a great impact; have totally change my approach to teaching
ISD 5 – 2017	It has great impact on me as a teacher and as a manager in my classes. In prepared me to face change and its consequence and even challenges me to creative and innovative
ISD 6 – 2017	Average
ISD 7 – 2018	The impact is great that what I've learned made me feel confident. I'm proud that I acquired many valuable things as an ISD graduate compared to graduates of other doctoral course
ISD 8 – 2018	The ISD curriculum helped the ISD students to be competent instructional designers

For many, they valued their learning experiences and considered these rewarding and challenging. A closer bonding among them has developed and they can synergize one another. The actual trainings hat they conducted in the field to enhance their extension activities proved to be worthwhile.



The tracer studies conducted in African and other developing countries (Kinami, 2001) examine if the education given to the graduates had been producing the kind of skills they expect from their graduates. Surveys on graduates are often seen as an important tool of institutional development (Schomburg & Sawyerr, n.d.)

The program had a great impact in their work. This is because they have now become innovators in teaching and learning. From the casual interview they believed that their course had opened their minds to become more creative in developing and designing instructional materials, modules, manual and other teaching aids.

## CONCLUSIONS

The assessment of the Ph.D-ISD graduates on the curriculum and subjects revealed the following: the subjects and courses were Relevant because they could use their knowledge in the development and designing of instructional materials needed their schools. For those who had office works aside from their teaching job, the ADDIE model was effective in systematizing their work activities. They also find the content and topics in the ISD adequate however some subjects are repetitive. They find the available references inadequate and limited, although they can make good use of the internet materials. The graduates also indicate that the subjects and courses taken had a great impact especially that these help to empower them to construct and become creative. The ISD program is relevant, effective and has great impact, thus this should be continued as one of the Ph.D Programs in the Graduate School of Bukidnon State University. Since the resource materials and books are inadequate, there is a need to make good use of the internet sources in the SGS library and computer laboratories to augment the meager books and materials found in the graduate library.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

1. There is a need for the Graduate School librarian to purchase books and other resource materials on the different ISD subjects upon the recommendation of the professors teaching the courses; and
2. The new technology subjects on enhancing computer utilization should require students to really come up with projects related to computer assisted materials/ video production/ etc.

## LITERATURE CITED

- Derequito, A. D. & Olbe, R. B. (2013). *A tracer study of the graduates of Don Jose Sustiguer Monfort Memorial National College (WVCST Branch) from SY 1991-2002*. <http://www.wvcst.eduph/research/researchers/research.htm>
- Dewey, J. (1933). *How We Think: A Restatement of Reflective Thinking to the Educative Process*. Boston: D. C. Heath. (Original work published in 1910)
- Gibbs, G. (1988). *Learning by Doing: A guide to teaching and learning methods*. Oxford: Further Education Unit.
- Jobst, J. W. (2007). *College curricula and assessment of recent graduates*. <http://www.sta.org/confproceed/1997/PDFs/0032PDF#search==curriculum%20assessment%20graduates>
- Kaijage, E. (n.d.). *the FCM graduate: A tracer study of the faculty of Commerce and Management Graduates*; retrieved on Sept. 24 2005 from <http://wwwsrhe.ac.uk/southafrica/abstract/SYMSchumburgSawyer.htm>
- Kimani, G. N. (2016). *How to conduct tracer studies in Africa: approaches and experiences*, A paper presented to Conference on Globalization and higher Education; Views from the south, Carp Town, South Africa, <http://wwwtpsdp/for/TOR/Tracerstudy.DOC>
- Kimani, G. N. (2017). *Tracer Studies and Labor market signals for higher education graduates*. [http://www/wedtik/tps.lp/tr/TOR tracer study. IDOC](http://www/wedtik/tps.lp/tr/TOR%20tracer%20study.IDOC)
- Kolb, D. A. (1984). *Experiential Learning: Experience as a Source of Learning and Development*. *Englewood Cliffs, NJ*: Prentice-Hall.
- Schön, D. A. (1987). *Educating the Reflective Practitioner*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Kranz, P. L., Steele, R. A., Lund, N. L. & Cook, S. B. (2014). *Employment success and Satisfaction among graduates of Tennessee Technology University Masters of Science program in fisheries management*, <http://www/findarticles.com/pl/articles/mi-Mofcg/is231/ai>

- Macale, H. B. (2003). *Journalism Education: Not a walk in the park*. Retrieved from <http://www.emfr.comph/pjr2003/2000304/030macale/htm>
- Mayanja, M. K. (n.d). *A Comparative Study of Makerere University Graduates of the Faculties of Arts and Sciences*: retrieved on Sept. 24, 2005, from <http://www.srhe.ac.uk./southafrica/abstract/SYMSchumburgSawyerr.html>
- Mohanty, B. (n.d). *Terms of reference for Conducting a Tracer Study*, Retrieved from on Sept. 24, 2005 from [www.sea-themaiiait.ac.th](http://www.sea-themaiiait.ac.th)
- Mugabushaka, A., Schomburg, H. & Teicher, U. (2003). *Tracer Studies in Africa A comparative Analysis* Retrieved from <http://www2.nesu.edu/nesu.aern/KIM-ART.PDF>
- Schumburg, H. & Sawyerr A. (n.d.). *Higher education and work in Africa: procedures are* <http://www.srhe.ac.uk/southafrica/abstracts/SYMSchumburgSawyerr.html>
- Schumburg, H. (n.d). *Professional Success- graduates from institution of higher education in Africa and Europe* Retrieved on Sept. 24, 2005, from <http://www.srhe.ac.uk/southafrica/abstracts/SYMSchumburgSawyerr.html>
- SEAMEO Innotech. (2003) *Tracer study on Graduates of Polytechnical and Vocational*. Retrieved from <http://www.seameo-innotech.org/resources/ein/rdv/32.asp>
- University of Namibia. (2002). *Regional Workshop Tracer Studies of Past University Students*.
- World Bank Group. (2001) *Alumni Tracer Studies-Executive Summary: Synopsis of Salient Findings*. *PJR Philippine Journal review*.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author wishes to express her sincere and heartfelt gratitude to Bukidnon State University for the encouragement in conducting the research. Likewise, the author is grateful and thankful to the Editor-in-Chief as well as the Office of the Vice President for Research, Publication and Extension of Liceo de Cagayan University for accepting the paper.